

DRAFT Hate Crime Scrutiny Review

Tuesday 23 March 2021

Email: scrutiny@bradford.gov.uk

Twitter: Bfd_Scrutiny



Membership of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Members

Cllr Nazam Azam, (Chair)
Cllr Angela Tait, (Deputy Chair)
Cllr David Green
Cllr Kamran Hussain
Cllr Rosie Watson
Cllr Mohammed Shafiq
Cllr Matthew Bibby
Cllr Mike Pollard
Cllr Naveed Riaz
Cllr Alun Griffiths

Alternate Members

Cllr Sameena Akhtar
Cllr Fareeda Mir
Cllr Tariq Hussain
Cllr Sarfraz Nazir
Cllr Taj Salam
Cllr Geoff Winnard
Cllr Val Townend
Cllr Gerry Barker
Cllr Geoff Reid

Contact for Enquiries

Mustansir Butt
Overview and Scrutiny Lead
E-mail – mustansir.butt@bradford.gov.uk
Tel (01274) 432574

Contents

Chair's Foreword	4
Executive Summary	5
Chapter 1: Introduction	6
Chapter 2: Key Findings	9
Chapter 3: Concluding Remarks	16
Chapter4: Summary of Scrutiny Review Recommendations	17
▪ Appendix 1: Terms of Reference.	
▪ Appendix 2: Information evidence-gathering participants.	

Chairs Foreword

Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee undertook this scrutiny review in order to review the effectiveness of approached being undertaken by Bradford Council and its partners in addressing Hate Crime across the District, as well as recommending improvements in tackling Hate Crime across the District.

During the course of the information gathering sessions for this scrutiny review. Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee members have engaged widely with individuals and communities. Also consulted widely with representatives of communities who are vulnerable to prejudice, those partner organisations who are responsible for protecting and supporting victims of Hate Crime and Bradford Council Officers.

Hate Crime is complex, with links to wider issues such as education, understanding and cohesion. This is a significant issue affecting not just communities in the District, but nationally and internationally.

Due to the increase in the number of Hate Crime reports across the District, the need to deter Hate Crime and make people feel and be safer has become more paramount. Whilst it is important that more people report incidents of Hate Crime, we also need to ensure that the outcomes for Hate Crime victims are more than satisfactory.

In light of the COVID19 pandemic and shrinking resources, it has become even more clearer whilst undertaking this scrutiny review, of the need for a multi-agency and multi-faceted partnership approach to effectively addressing Hate Crime; resulting also in a more co-ordinated approach to supporting those individuals who have unfortunately experienced Hate Crime.

I would like to thank fellow councillors of the Committee and Council officers for taking part in this scrutiny review, but my thanks especially go to the members of a variety of experts, faith groups, community groups and representatives from different organisations who took the time to attend the information-gathering sessions and to contribute their ideas and experience so fully to our discussions.

This is not the end, but the start of a process to tackle Hate Crime more effectively across the District.

Cllr Nazam Azam
Chair, Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Executive Summary

This scrutiny review follows on from the recommendation made by Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee to undertake a detailed scrutiny review into the effectiveness of Bradford Council and its partners in addressing hate crime across the District.

This issue first came to the surface when members of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered the Safer Communities Plan and Quarter 1 Performance.

This review offers a wider perspective on ways in which Bradford Council and its partners, can address Hate Crime across the District.

The six information gathering sessions undertaken as part of this scrutiny review focused on the nine key areas for improvement, in accordance with the Terms of Reference, adopted at the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee on Thursday 11 April 2019. Specifically, the committee resolved to:

- consider the trends and hotspots for incidences of Hate Crime across the District;
- analyse the preventative measures being used to stop Hate Crime from happening;
- examine the effectiveness of support provided to victims of Hate Crime;
- evaluate the outcomes of the support provided to victims of Hate Crime;
- engage with victims and perpetrators of Hate Crime.

As a result of the review, this Committee has made a number of recommendations for consideration. These are contained (a) within the body of the report and (b) summarised at the end for ease of reference.

Chapter 1 - Introduction

At its meeting on Thursday 11 April 2019, the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee agreed to undertake an in-depth Scrutiny Review, into the effectiveness of Bradford Council and its partners in addressing hate crime across the District.

This issue came to the surface when members of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered the Safer Communities Plan and Quarter 1 Performance. During the discussions, members agreed to undertake a detailed scrutiny review into the effectiveness of Bradford Council and its partners in addressing hate crime across the District.

Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee members began their deliberations on Thursday 5 September 2019, with a scene setting session. At the information gathering sessions on Wednesday 16 October 2019 members engaged with Muslim, Christian, Jewish, Hindu and Sikh faith groups. This was followed up by Corporate Overview & Scrutiny members having information gathering sessions with Community Groups and Disability Groups on Thursday 31 October 2019. At the information gathering session on Wednesday 5 February 2020, Councillor met with victims of Hate Crime at Hate Crime Alliance Centre in Bradford.

The final informal gathering session with the LGBTQ+ community, for this Scrutiny Review, had been organised for March 2020. However, due to the national lockdown as a result of the COVID19 pandemic, this session was cancelled and re-arranged for Thursday 12 November 2020.

Key Aims and Scrutiny Process

The key aims of this stage in the scrutiny review are as outlined on the previous page.

Members have received and gathered a range of information from a number of different sources, including:

- relevant documents;
- relevant data;
- written submissions from, or meetings with, interested parties.

Context

The definition Hate Crime is, any criminal offence perceived by the victim or any other person to be motivated by hostility or prejudice based on person's race, perceived race, religion, perceived religion, sexual orientation, perceived sexual orientation, transgender, perceived transgender, disability, perceived disability.

This definition is the Crown Prosecution Service definition of Hate Crime, that is also used by the Police and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance.

Local Context

Bradford Councils Hate Crime Strategy 2017 – 2020, is aimed at supporting and highlighting Bradford's approach to addressing Hate Crime across the District. The strategy also highlights the Hate Crime priorities for the District.

There are 28 Independent Hate Crime Reporting Centres situated across the District with trained staff, for individuals to be able to report incidences of Hate Crime. The Hate Crime reporting centres are reviewed annually, to also provide updates on training which reflect any changes in legislation, policies and procedures.

Bradford Hate Crime Alliance manages all the Hate Crime Reporting Centres across the District.

During the informal information gathering sessions for this Scrutiny Review, Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Members were very keen to consider the number of reports to each Hate Crime Reporting Centre and which areas those reports are coming from.

Table 1 below shows the number of Hate Crime Reports at each of the 28 Hate Crime Reporting Centres across the District, for 2019 – *Bradford Hate Crime Alliance*.

	Hate Crime Reporting Centre	Number of Hate Crime Reports
1	Accent Housing Bradford – BD17	19
2	Al Mahdi Mosque – BD3	1
3	Bradford Hate Crime Alliance – BD8	18
4	Bradford College – BD7	4
5	Bradford University – BD7	0
6	Bradford People First – BD5	3
7	Bradford Talking Media – BD1	0
8	Bradford City Match Day Reporting – BD8	0
9	Equity Partnership – BD1	3
10	Girlington Advice Centre – BD9	2
11	Great Horton Village Hall – BD7	0
12	Khidmat Centre Bradford – BD7	0
13	Manningham Housing Association – BD1	12
14	MIND – BD1	5
15	Morley Street Resource Centre – BD7	3
16	Prospects – BD1	0
17	Ravenscliffe Gateway Centre – BD10	0
18	Rockwell Community Centre, Thorpe Edge – BD10	0
19	Shine Project – BD5	0
20	Victim Support – BD18	0
21	Yorkshire MESMAC – BD1	2
22	Central Hall – BD21	0
23	Keighley and Craven Peoples First – BD21	0
24	Good Shephard Centre – BD22	2
25	Keighley Council Customer Service Office – BD21	3
26	KAWACC Centre – BD21	0
27	Incommunities – BD18	26
28	ShIPLEY College – BD18	0

Table 1 below shows the Hate incidents 2016 to October 2020 – *West Yorkshire Police*.

Year	All Hate	Race	Faith	Disability	Sexual Orientation	Transgender
2016	1,415	1,153	82	53	124	51
2017	1,739	1,345	128	123	160	24
2018	2,116	1,582	127	195	210	35
2019	2,236	1,657	150	204	250	49
2020	2,043	1,550	108	157	240	30

Chapter 2 – Key Findings

This section presents the findings of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee into Hate Crime, covering the agreed key lines of enquiry for this Scrutiny Review.

Whilst it was acknowledged that there was good work being undertaken by Bradford Council and its partner organisations in addressing Hate Crime across the District, participants in this scrutiny review process also felt that this work was being undertaken in ad-hoc manner and more could be done in improving the approaches to tackle this very important area.

Moreover, during the information gathering sessions several participants highlighted the importance of acknowledging that Hate Crime is a major issue across the District.

Due to the nature of this topic, the key findings for this scrutiny review will inevitable overlap, however the key findings will be considered under the recurring issues that have arisen during this scrutiny review and have centred around:

- Under reporting of Hate Crime across the District;
- A lack of understanding amongst individuals and communities, about what Hate Crime is;
- Having a more co-ordinated approach across the District to address Hate Crime;
- Resources required to support victims of Hate Crime, as well as undertaking preventative work;
- Communicating key Hate Crime messages across the whole of the District.

Under reporting of Hate Crime across the District

A consistent theme throughout all of the information gathering sessions for this Scrutiny Review was that there was a lot of under reporting of Hate Crime across the District. Several contributions, but particularly the victims of Hate Crime revealed that new and emerging communities such as Roma and travelling communities didn't know where to report Hate Crime.

As well as this, representatives from the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance also stated that there was a lot of under reporting amongst South Asian women, with cultural barriers being a contributory factor here.

Representatives from Faith groups informed Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Councillors that there is challenge working with Eastern European, Central European and refugee communities, in that they did not know enough about these communities, what their issues are and how they can be supported in reporting Hate Crime. There was consensus amongst Faith Group representatives that not enough was being done to support these communities.

Recommendation 1

That in order to reduce underreporting and improve after care victim support of Hate Crime within specific groups, Bradford Council, Hate Bradford Hate Crime Alliance and the Police should undertake targeted work particularly with those groups that are known to underreport.

Participants stressed the importance of addressing the key challenge of enabling and encouraging people to report Hate Crime and individuals not feeling that reporting Hate Crime will not get them anywhere, in terms of a satisfactory outcome . This was particularly highlighted during discussions with Bradford Council Officers and Faith groups.

Furthermore, discussions between the Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee Councillors and the LGBTQ+ community, further exasperated this issue in that one of the reasons why there was under reporting of Hate Crime across the District was that individuals did not think that if they reported Hate Crime, it will be treated seriously.

It was patently clear from discussions with representatives from Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, that they had limited resources and time to deal in an effective and timely manner, with not just Hate Crime reporting, but also awareness raising of Hate Crime.

There was overwhelming support amongst Corporate Overview & Scrutiny councillors and Bradford Council Officers that there needed to be greater awareness raising of Hate Crime and the importance of reporting Hate Crime to all communities across the Bradford District.

Recommendation 2

That a programme of Hate Crime events, for all communities across the District, aimed awareness raising of the importance of reporting Hate Crime, be built into the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance contract.

Recommendation 3

That the Bradford Hate Co-ordinator continues to work with key partners to develop a software app which seeks to establish easy recording mechanisms, reporting hate incidents in a confidential way and request only the key information of location, time and type; whilst also showing examples of good practice where Hate Crime has been successfully dealt with.

Officers from the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance informed Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee Councillors that that there are 28 Hate Crime reporting centres across the District, where people who have been victims of Hate Crime can report their case and that Hate Crime could also be reported on the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance website.

Members also heard, that individuals did not feel comfortable in attending Police stations to report Hate Crime due to the limited resources and time that the Police had to deal with their cases; and subsequently felt more comfortable reporting Hate Crime at one of the designated Hate Crime Reporting centres.

At one of the information gathering sessions for this scrutiny review, victims of Hate Crime indicated to Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee members that some individuals who were responsible for receiving Hate Crime reports at the Hate Crime Reporting Centres, did not appear to have the necessary experience to deal with the reports satisfactorily.

Continuing with this theme, this was further explored and discussed by Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Councillors, with disabled groups. The experience of disabled groups when reporting Hate Crime was that the staff receiving the Hate Crime report appeared to be not interested. As a result, individuals here lost their confidence and self belief.

Other examples were also provided to Councillors by disabled groups, relating to instances where they had reported Hate Crime and nothing had happened as a result of that. There was also a high degree of uncertainty amongst this group, concerning the level of support that would be provided to them, once they reported a Hate Crime incident and the situation deteriorated.

Furthermore, this was a consistent theme across all the information gathering sessions, in that training to individuals who were responsible for receiving Hate Crime reports had been provided a long time ago, therefore there was a need to provide refresher training and support to individuals receiving Hate Crime reports.

Recommendation 4

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator, the Police and Victim Support work with Bradford Hate Crime Alliance to deliver refresher training to all individuals at Hate Crime Reporting Centres who are responsible for receiving Hate Crime report and also to develop a refresher programme for regular training, as well as developing a programme of after-care support for individuals who report Hate Crime.

A lack of understanding of in Hate Crime

Following on from the under reporting of Hate Crime across the Bradford District, discussions in all the information gathering sessions revealed that the main contributing factor to the under reporting of Hate Crime, was a lack of understanding amongst individuals and communities in relation to what Hate Crime actually is.

For instance during the information gathering session with the LGBTQ+ community, it was felt when they reported Hate Crime, the individuals who are responsible for receiving the Hate Crime reports at the Hate Crime Reporting Centres, often needed to be educated, particularly on areas such as the use of language. In addition to this, Councillors also heard that as a lot of information was required to make the Hate Crime report, this whole task became onerous, as members of the LGBTQ+ community would then need to educate individuals receiving the report, on aspects of use of language.

Victims of Hate Crime were keen to stress to Corporate Overview and Scrutiny members, the importance of understanding that Hate Crime should not just be limited to race, transgender and faith, as there are also other groups that are affected by Hate Crime. Participants here also emphasised that Hate Crime does not have to be physical, but could also be verbal; which was equally damaging.

This view was also expressed by faith groups, who made contributions to this scrutiny review.

Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee Councillors were in agreement throughout the information gathering sessions for this scrutiny review, that education and the use of language in relation to Hate Crime is crucial in being able to effectively address Hate Crime across the District, as people can often say things that they feel will not cause any harm.

This was further highlighted during discussions with representatives from the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, who also suggested that education should start in schools, but some schools felt that they were not being supported to effectively tackle Hate Crime, thus they felt less confident in tackling Hate Crime related issues – the difficult issues.

During the information gathering sessions, Bradford Hate Crime Alliance representatives informed Councillors that from the visit is they undertake to people's homes, they discovered that there was a lack of understanding amongst communities over what Hate Crime is. Subsequently, as mentioned in the earlier section under the recurring theme "*Under reporting of Hate Crime across the District*", the lack of understanding amongst individuals in relation to what Hate Crime is, contributed to under reporting of Hate Crime, as people would not be aware of verbal actions directed towards them that would constitute Hate Crime.

Recommendation 5

That the Hate Crime and key partners works towards raising the understanding of Hate Crime across all local communities in the District, by developing a simple, easy to understand explanation of what Hate Crime is and for this to be used in awareness raising materials and campaigns.

Furthermore, this was further explored and discussed with Disabled groups, who emphasised that they did not know what Hate Crime was. Equally as important, they also felt that they were not aware how to report and write down Hate Crime related incidents.

As a suggested way forward, both Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee Councillors and the Disabled Groups were in agreement that perhaps undertaking role-playing exercises, with pictures and videos to smaller Disabled groups would help improve their understanding of Hate Crime and how to report Hate Crime.

Recommendation 6

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator, the Police, Voluntary Community Sector, Hate Crime Reporting Centres and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, liaise with Morley Street Resource to develop and deliver a bespoke training session for Disabled groups, aimed at improving their understanding of Hate Crime and also of how they can report Hate Crime incidents.

Recommendation 7

That material is produced for support workers in the areas of disability, mental health, and sign language and translation services to increase awareness of Hate Crime services.

Further to this, in conversations with Disabled groups, Councillors heard that if an individual had experienced Hate Crime, they would just treat this as part of their life and it was just a normal part of their life. Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee were very concerned to hear this, as this a particularly vulnerable group and this group needed specific and targeted support, through the setting up of a Disability Hate Crime Group. Councillors were in agreement that multi-agency approach was key to Disabled groups receiving training and support in relation to Hate Crime.

Recommendation 8

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator works with the Morley Street Resource Centre, in developing a Disability Hate Crime Group, aimed at providing specific and focused Hate Crime training and support to all Disabled groups.

Co-ordinated approach to addressing Hate Crime across the District

During the course of the information gathering sessions for this Scrutiny Review, members were repeatedly told that there is a lot of good work being done on a voluntary basis, but this work was not done in a structured and co-ordinated manner. Participants also indicated that the Hate Crime work being undertaken, would actually also be more effective if it was co-ordinated better.

Concerns were also raised by the victims of Hate Crime, in that they were also unaware at first where the support was available for them and despite the support of services for victims of Hate Crime were getting better, there was still substantial room for improvement. In addition to this, victims of Hate Crime also indicated to Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Councillors that even after the Hate Crime had been committed, they felt the effects of that for a long time, thus having a long lasting impact. Therefore, there needed to be more longer term support provided to victims of Hate Crime, in a co-ordinated manner.

In addition to this, Faith groups also suggested that more bridging and brokering work should be undertaken, with a view to having a more co-ordinated approach to tackling Hate Crime across the District. In fact, representatives from the Faith groups went on to say that there should be more effective partnership working, using these informal information gathering sessions for this scrutiny review as a model to engage more wider with communities, by creating a multi agency Hate Crime Group.

Recommendation 9

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, facilitate the development of a Multi Agency Hate Crime Group consisting of key groups and partners, aimed at the sharing of resources, co-ordination of work being undertaken for Hate Crime across the whole of the Bradford District and a more joined up approach to supporting victims of Hate Crime.

The resourcing of supporting victims of Hate Crime

Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee Councillors felt that the resourcing of support to Hate Crime victims, was crucial. This was further highlighted at one of the information gathering sessions, where representatives from Bradford Hate Crime Alliance stated that they only have one and a half members of staff who deal with Hate Crime across the whole of the District. Further discussions relating to this centred around the importance of using other resource approaches, such as Councillor surgeries to talk about Hate Crime with residents.

Moreover, colleagues from Bradford Hate Crime Alliance also alerted members to the issue that the resourcing of Hate Crime across the District is a huge issue and investment into more resources was required in order to raise awareness for Hate Crime, tackle Hate Crime, as well as undertaking targeted awareness raising work in schools, colleges and educational establishments.

The different communities, who were also consulted as part of this Scrutiny Review, also highlighted the importance of the sharing of resources across the District, to tackle Hate Crime more effectively across the District.

Recommendation 10

That Bradford Council works with its key partners with a view to developing a programme of sharing best practice and resources, to target and address Hate Crime more effectively across the District.

Recommendation 11

That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-coordinator explores possible funding streams, to carry out Hate Crime work, including but not limited to, awareness raising, preventative work and support activities.

Communication and Awareness raising

During the information gathering sessions, participants informed Councillors that there needed to be greater communication and awareness raising in relation to Hate Crime, particularly amongst children and young people. It was felt that engagement in schools was fundamental, as by engaging with children in schools, engagement would also take place with teachers and parents. More importantly, this learning would also go home with the child.

This becomes more significant, as Councillors and Faith groups also highlighted that the children and young people were the future, especially as Bradford also has the highest youngest population in the District.

As well as this, representatives from Bradford Hate Crime Alliance and Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee Councillors highlighted that Hate Crime of minorities within minorities or protected groups is an issue, particularly in schools. It was also felt that the upbringing at home was crucial and that there needed to be education for all and with

there being parental responsibility here – needing to develop a programme that is aimed at parents about use of language and understanding types of Hate Crime.

Recommendation 12

That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator and key partners work with schools to encourage training and development, where resources allow, of Hate Crime to support both staff and pupils to raise awareness and knowledge.

There was consensus amongst Councillors and all participants during this review, that there needed to be consistent communication messages being circulated into communities; letting people know of examples when Hate Crime has happened as a result of someone reporting a Hate Crime incident, with positive stories of how Hate Crime cases were addressed, thus encouraging others to come forward and report Hate Crime incidences.

It was also felt that this would also raise awareness of Hate Crime amongst communities, whilst also demonstrating good examples of how Hate Crime was being addressed.

See recommendation 3.

Chapter 3 – Concluding Remarks

Throughout the course of this scrutiny review, Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee members heard that the

Managing Hate Crime is a multifaceted issue and it appears that there is no single approach that will deliver improvements in how Bradford Council manages attendance. In order to effectively address Hate Crime across the District, this scrutiny review has highlighted that a range of approaches will need to be adopted.

This Committee has sought to take a balanced approach in its deliberations relating to this Scrutiny review and aimed to ensure that this report encompasses the views and concerns of all interested parties.

The scrutiny review report identifies a number of recommendations. If implemented, these will further improve the approach that Bradford Council and its partners have in terms of addressing Hate Crime across the District.

Bradford Council's Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee, will monitor future progress against these scrutiny review recommendations.

Recommendation 13

Bradford Council's Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee to receive a report back in 12 months, which monitors the progress against all the recommendations contained within this scrutiny review.

Chapter 4 – Summary of Scrutiny Review Recommendations

Recommendation 1

That in order to reduce underreporting and improve after care victim support of Hate Crime within specific groups, Bradford Council, Hate Bradford Hate Crime Alliance and the Police should undertake targeted work particularly with those groups that are known to underreport.

Recommendation 2

That a programme of Hate Crime events, for all communities across the District, aimed awareness raising of the importance of reporting Hate Crime, be built into the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance contract.

Recommendation 3

That the Bradford Hate Co-ordinator continues to work with key partners to develop a software app which seeks to establish easy recording mechanisms, reporting hate incidents in a confidential way and request only the key information of location, time and type; whilst also showing examples of good practice where Hate Crime has been successfully dealt with.

Recommendation 4

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator, the Police and Victim Support work with Bradford Hate Crime Alliance to deliver refresher training to all individuals at Hate Crime Reporting Centres who are responsible for receiving Hate Crime report and also to develop a refresher programme for regular training, as well as developing a programme of after-care support for individuals who report Hate Crime.

Recommendation 5

That the Hate Crime and key partners works towards raising the understanding of Hate Crime across all local communities in the District, by developing a simple, easy to understand explanation of what Hate Crime is and for this to be used in awareness raising materials and campaigns.

Recommendation 6

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator, the Police, Voluntary Community Sector, Hate Crime Reporting Centres and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, liaise with Morley Street Resource to develop and deliver a bespoke training session for Disabled groups, aimed at improving their understanding of Hate Crime and also of how they can report Hate Crime incidents.

Recommendation 7

That material is produced for support workers in the areas of disability, mental health, and sign language and translation services to increase awareness of Hate Crime services.

Recommendation 8

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator works with the Morley Street Resource Centre, in developing a Disability Hate Crime Group, aimed at providing specific and focused Hate Crime training and support to all Disabled groups.

Recommendation 9

That Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, facilitate the development of a Multi Agency Hate Crime Group consisting of key groups and partners, aimed at the sharing of resources, co-ordination of work being undertaken for Hate Crime across the whole of the Bradford District and a more joined up approach to supporting victims of Hate Crime.

Recommendation 10

That Bradford Council works with its key partners with a view to developing a programme of sharing best practice and resources, to target and address Hate Crime more effectively across the District.

Recommendation 11

That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator explores possible funding streams, to carry out Hate Crime work, including but not limited to, awareness raising, preventative work and support activities.

Recommendation 12

That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator and key partners work with schools to encourage training and development, where resources allow, of Hate Crime to support both staff and pupils to raise awareness and knowledge.

Recommendation 13

Bradford Council's Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee to receive a report back in 12 months, which monitors the progress against all the recommendations contained within this scrutiny review.

**City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council
Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee**

**How effectively Bradford Council and its partners support victims of Hate Crime -
Scrutiny Review**

Terms of Reference

See Part 3E paragraphs 2.1 to 2.11 of the Constitution of the Council.

Background

Having considered the Safer Communities Plan and Quarter 1 Performance, Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee members, members agreed to undertake a detailed scrutiny review into the effectiveness of Bradford Council and its partners in addressing hate crime across the District.

Context

A hate crime or incident is any non-crime incident which is perceived, by the victim or any other person, to be motivated by hostility or prejudice based on person's:

- Race;
- Faith;
- Sexual orientation;
- Disability;
- Transgender Identity.

Key Lines of Enquiry

The key lines of enquiry for this scrutiny review are to:

- consider the trends and hotspots for incidences of Hate Crime across the District;
- analyse the preventative measures being used to stop Hate Crime from happening;
- examine the effectiveness of support provided to victims of Hate Crime;
- evaluate the outcomes of the support provided to victims of Hate Crime;
- engage with victims and perpetrators of Hate Crime.

Methodology

The committee will receive and consider a variety of evidence/information provided by a range of interested parties. The Committee may adopt one or more of the following methods to collect evidence/information:

- relevant documents;
- relevant data;
- written submissions from, or meetings with interested parties;
- undertake relevant visits.

Indicative list of interested parties

An indicative list of interested parties is provided below. This is not definitive or exclusive and can be developed as the scrutiny progresses.

Organisation / Department	Contact
Bradford Council Executive Portfolio Holder.	Cllr Abdul Jabar
Bradford Council.	Ian Day – Assistant Director Neighbourhoods. Michael Churley – Prevent Co-ordinator. Rifaquet Ali – Hate Crime Co-ordinator.
Local/Regional/National Organisations.	Bradford Hate Crime Alliance – Charles Dacres/Kate Butler. Hope Not Hate – Paul Meszaros. West Yorkshire Police – Inspector Kevin Taylor. Police Hate Crime Scrutiny Panel – Surinder Jagpal. Muslim faith – Zulfi Karim. Jewish faith – Laurence saffer. Christian faith - Bishop Toby. Sikh faith – Surinder Jagpal. Hindu faith – Manoj Joshi and Kamal Sharma. Sean Dobiech – African Community. Duncan Wahoo – Bradford Refugees Organisation. Maggie Barry – Bradford Immigration and Asylum Support Network. Nijam Mohammed – British Rohingya Community. Yusuf Karolia – Consortia of ethnic Minority Organisations. Yemi Fagborun/Charles Dacres – Afro Caribbean Community. Syrian Community Welfare. Moneer Zaid – Sudanese Community. Dorota Plata – The Good Shepherd Centre. Tom Hughes – Sandale Centre. Hiron Miah – Housing. Morley St Resource Centre. Hate Crime Reporting Centres. Rosie Ellingham - Yorkshire MESMAC. Andrea Ali - Equity Partnership.

Indicative Timetable

Date	Milestone
Thursday 11 April 2019.	DRAFT Terms of Reference to be presented to the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee – for discussion and approval.
Thursday 5 September 2019.	Information gathering session – Scene setting, (Bradford Council, West Yorkshire Police).
Wednesday 16 October 2019.	Information gathering session – Faith Groups, (Muslim, Christian, Jewish, Hindu and Sikh).
Thursday 31 October 2019.	Information gathering session – Community Groups.
Thursday 16 January 2020.	Information gathering session – Disability groups. Hate Crime Reporting Centres.
Wednesday 5 February 2020.	Information gathering session – Victims of Hate Crime. Hate Crime Reporting Centres.
Thursday 12 November 2020.	Information gathering session – LGBTQ+ Groups.
TBC.	Final review findings and recommendations to be considered by Corporate Overview and Scrutiny.

Hate Crime Scrutiny Review - Participants

First evidence-gathering session, City Hall, Bradford, Thursday 5 September 2019

- Cllr Nazam Azam, (Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Kamran Hussain, (Deputy Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Angela Tait, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr David Green, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Rosie Watson, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Matthew Bibby, (Members, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Inspector Kevin Taylor, (West Yorkshire Police).
- Surinder Jagpal, (Police Hate Crime Scrutiny Panel).
- Ian Day, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Michael Churley, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Mustansir Butt, (Overview & Scrutiny, Bradford Council).

Second evidence-gathering session, City Hall, Bradford, Wednesday 16 October 2019

- Cllr Kamran Hussain, (Deputy Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Angela Tait, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr David Green, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Rosie Watson, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Matthew Bibby, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Richard Dunbar, (Alternate Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Surinder Jagpal, (Sikh faith group).
- Zulfi Karim, (Muslim faith group).
- Laurence Saffer, (Jewish faith group).
- Kamal Sharma, (Hindu faith group).
- Ian Day, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Michael Churley, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Mustansir Butt, (Overview & Scrutiny, Bradford Council).

Third evidence-gathering session, City Hall, Bradford, Thursday 31 October 2019

- Cllr Nazam Azam, (Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Kamran Hussain, (Deputy Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Angela Tait, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr David Green, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Rosie Watson, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Matthew Bibby, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Richard Dunbar, (Alternate Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Kate Butler, (Bradford Hate Crime Alliance).
- Charles Dacres, (Hate Crime Consultant).
- Ian Day, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Michael Churley, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).

- Mustansir Butt, (Overview & Scrutiny, Bradford Council).

Fourth evidence-gathering session, Morley Street Resource Centre, Bradford, Thursday 16 January 2020

- Cllr Nazam Azam, (Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Kamran Hussain, (Deputy Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr David Green, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Richard Dunbar, (Alternate Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Abdul Jabar, (Portfolio Holder, Bradford Council).
- Graham Kershaw, (Morley Street Resource Centre).
- Gail Wright, (Morley Street Resource Centre).
- Catherine Smith, (Morley Street Resource Centre).
- 18 Disabled members of the Morley Street Resource User Group).
- Ian Day, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Michael Churley, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Mustansir Butt, (Overview & Scrutiny, Bradford Council).

Fifth evidence-gathering session, Hate Crime Alliance Centre, Bradford, Wednesday 5 February 2020

- Cllr Nazam Azam, (Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Angela Tait, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Charles Dacres, (Bradford Hate Crime Alliance).
- Kate Butler, (Bradford Hate Crime Alliance).
- Byron Francis, (Bradford Hate Crime Alliance).
- 7 victims of Hate Crime.
- Michael Churley, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Mustansir Butt, (Overview & Scrutiny, Bradford Council).

Sixth evidence-gathering session, Remote Virtual Session, Thursday 12 November 2020

- Cllr Nazam Azam, (Chair, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Angela Tait, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr David Green, (Member, Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee).
- Cllr Abdul Jabar, (Portfolio Holder, Bradford Council).
- Charles Dacres, (Bradford Hate Crime Alliance).
- Rosie Ellingham, (MESMAC).
- Andrea Ali, (Equity Partnership).
- Cllr Julie Lintern, (Keighley Pride).
- Rifaquet Ali, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Ian Day, (Neighbourhoods, Bradford Council).
- Mustansir Butt, (Overview & Scrutiny, Bradford Council).